

# Rubric Comprehensive Program Review & CTE 2024

Rubric CPR Template 2024

## Rubric Comprehensive Program Review 2024

Instructional Discipline Template

### A. Program Information

#### Narrative Criteria

The Program Mission Statement

- clearly states the purpose of the program
- indicates the primary function
- indicates the activities of the program
- describes the programs' aspirational goals for the future and what the program hopes to achieve
- reflects the program's priorities and values
- indicates who the students and/or stakeholders are
- is aligned to the college mission statement
- is clear and concise

- Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

#### Feedback

Meets Expectations - The mission statement effectively communicates the program's goals, aligning with the college's broader mission of equitable access to education. It emphasizes innovation, inclusivity, and industry alignment. Consider elaborating on specific strategies to achieve inclusivity and equitable access, such as targeted outreach or support services.

### B. Enrollment Trends

#### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

#### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

- Data  
 Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

- Narrative  
 Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

#### Feedback

The analysis effectively highlights trends, acknowledges external factors like the pandemic, and aligns goals with sustainable enrollment, using strategic stacking to maintain productivity. However, it lacks actionable solutions for sustaining or growing FTES. Include detailed strategies for outreach to underserved communities, innovative marketing, and impactful technology or infrastructure investments. Clarify the vague goal of "sustainable FTES" by specifying its criteria, and address future challenges or opportunities for a more actionable plan.

### C. Enrollment by Student Demographics

#### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

**Narrative Criteria**

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Data

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

**Feedback**

The goals statement would benefit from elaboration on why 20% is the goal for female participation. It is especially odd that 20% is the goal, when a) the college population is so much higher than 20% female and b) the program itself is even above 20% female. It is further unclear why the program's efforts toward gender diversity are focused on off-campus resources (e.g., advisory board) when there is a large population of female students on campus at Foothill. Why not focus some recruiting energies on campus, for example in arts-adjacent programs like music or art, or having a booth at club day. There could be more in-person/zoom marketing or performances that attract female students from arts courses. There could be on campus job fairs that attract female students/enrollment for MTEC and STEM fields. You could also host a MTEC Open House.

The narrative is also perplexing in asserting that the program is more diverse than the college as a whole, when it appears to be far more white than the college. The narrative asserts that this diversity arose organically, but it's unclear whether there is indeed diversity. In this sense, the program's narrative does not appear to match the evidence.

**D. Overall Student Course Success**

Click the link below to view the program's Course Success by Modality data

[https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/20078222\\_fhda\\_edu/Euw5yUwbvn5OiqkDTAn6yIYBycY0PmlnLpXnQm47I7cPKQ?e=rSml5L](https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/20078222_fhda_edu/Euw5yUwbvn5OiqkDTAn6yIYBycY0PmlnLpXnQm47I7cPKQ?e=rSml5L)

**Data Criteria**

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

**Narrative Criteria**

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Data

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

**Feedback**

The program's goal is to achieve student success metrics that exceed the college as a whole. The narrative could be expanded "online training/RSI workshops" for retention, equity and gender for the MTEC/Music discipline.

At numerous points, the program proposes an expansion of RSI strategies to support student success. What makes the program think that a lack of RSI strategies is the cause of lower success? The strategy of enhancing RSI seems to come up somewhat abruptly without much evidence or reflection to indicate that additional RSI strategies would be helpful.

Although RSI is one strategy to support student success, another strategy would be to engage with the professional development workshops offered on campus that deal with retention, equity, and gender.

## E. Disproportionate Impact

Click the link below to view the program's Disproportionate Impact data

[https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/20078222\\_fhda\\_edu/Euw5yUwbn5OiqkDTAn6yIYBycY0PmInLpXnQm47I7cPKQ?e=rSml5L](https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f:/g/personal/20078222_fhda_edu/Euw5yUwbn5OiqkDTAn6yIYBycY0PmInLpXnQm47I7cPKQ?e=rSml5L)

### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Data

- Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

Narrative

- Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

### Feedback

The program identifies success gaps among Black, Latinx, and Pacific Islander students and sets goals to close these gaps. However, the action plan is general and lacks detailed interventions. Develop targeted support services, such as mentorship programs or culturally relevant curriculum enhancements. Track and report the effectiveness of these initiatives over time.

The narrative suggests that the number of students reflected in the success gaps is "relatively small." However, relatively speaking in the program, it seems like 26 Latine students is not necessarily that small. The narrative suggests that additional "tutoring, targeted workshops, and regular check-ins" will assist in closing disproportionate impacts, but it's unclear whether those strategies will be helpful. What observations or evidence supports the use of those interventions in the present context? We don't want the program to be "spinning its wheels" implementing lots of new activities unless there's a promising outlook for impact.

Why do you think live streaming is the answer? How do you know it will be successful? What is this assumption based on? Has the department discussed offering more on campus sections? Other departments in our division have done this and had a positive impact on decreasing disproportionate impact. This might be something that the MTEC department considers

## F. Regular and Substantive Interaction

### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Narrative

- Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

## Feedback

The section lists a variety of RSI practices, indicating compliance with distance education standards.

## G. Summative Evaluation

Overall, the Comprehensive Program Review

- Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

## Feedback

The program demonstrates strengths in maintaining high productivity and innovation. However, areas like ethnic diversity, gender diversity, course success rates, and addressing disproportionate impact require more detailed strategies and actions. By implementing more robust outreach (both on and off campus) and support mechanisms, the program could better align with its stated mission and institutional goals. The program should also consider scheduling and modality options that would attract and support a new population of students in this program. The summary would benefit from an actionable roadmap for improvement.

End of Rubric CPR Template 2024

CTE Rubric 2024

## Career and Technical Education Programs Rubric 2024

### A. Re-Accreditation Information

#### 2. Did the program maintain accreditation?

- The program was reaccredited and received commendations or citations or recommendations - Meets Expectations  
 The program was put on probation - Needs Improvement

#### 5. What actions has the program taken to address the accreditation citations/recommendations? What barriers has the program faced in implementing improvements?

Did the program make the required improvements?

- The program was able to take actions and received the needed support to take the actions - Meets Expectations  
 The program was not able to take actions to improve because it did not get the support needed from the college - Needs Some Improvement  
 The program had the needed support to take actions but did not act or is limited in direction from the accreditor to take actions - Needs Major Improvement  
 Not Applicable (The program did not receive recommendations)

## Feedback

NA - This program does not have program-specific accreditation.

### B. Advisory Board

1. Did the program hold an annual advisory board meeting each year of the five-year cycle?
2. Did the program submit the advisory board meeting minutes each year of the five-year cycle?
3. Did the program include the web address/link to the online minutes?

- Yes the program held an annual meeting of the advisory board and submitted the minutes - Meets Expectations  
 No, the program did not hold an annual meeting of the advisory board and/or did not submit the minutes - Needs Improvement

#### 4. Were there any advisory board commendations/special mentions identified?

- The program received commendations - Meets Expectations  
 Not Applicable

#### 5. Are there any identified actions for improvement or recommendations based on feedback from the program's advisory board?

#### 6. What actions has the program taken to address recommendations made by the Advisory Board? What barriers has the program faced in implementing improvements?

- The program was able to take actions or investigate the recommendations and received the needed support to proceed - Meets Expectations  
 The program was not able to take actions or investigate because it did not get the support needed - Needs Some Improvement  
 The program had the needed support to take actions but did not act or is limited in direction from the advisory board to take actions - Needs Major Improvement  
 Not Applicable (The program did not receive recommendations)

## Feedback

The program held annual advisory board meetings and submitted minutes consistently. The advisory board commended the program's innovative curriculum, professional-grade resources, and alignment with industry needs. Actions to address feedback, such as integrating additional DAW software and enhancing infrastructure for personal device compatibility, demonstrate responsiveness to board recommendations.

## C. Regional Labor Demand

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/24-25-pr-data/cte-data/cte-labor-demand-2024-25.pdf>

1. In the data table above, what does the regional labor demand data trend indicate?

- Labor demand has an upward trend or is projected to be flat - Meets Expectations
- Labor demand is projected to decrease - Needs Improvement

2. Describe the regional demand for labor in this sector. If the projected data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in labor demand, explain why.

### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

## Feedback

N/A

## D. Regional Labor Supply

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/24-25-pr-data/cte-data/cte-labor-supply-2024-25.pdf>

1. In the data table above, what does the regional labor supply data trend indicate?

- Labor supply has a downward trend or is projected to be flat - Meets Expectations
- Labor supply is projected to increase - Needs Improvement

2. Describe the regional supply for labor in this sector over the last five years. If the data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in labor supply, explain why.

### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

## Feedback

Labor supply trends show a slight decrease, attributed to the pandemic's impact. While the narrative explains these trends effectively, the program could provide additional strategies to address potential supply gaps or encourage workforce entry in this field.

## E. Regional Wages

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/24-25-pr-data/cte-data/cte-regional-wages-2024-25.pdf>

1. In the data table above, what does the wage data trend indicate?

- The occupational wage trend increased or stayed flat - Meets Expectations
- The occupational wage trend decreased - Needs Improvement

2. Describe the regional trend for wages in this sector over the last five years. If the data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in wages, explain why.

**Narrative Criteria**

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

**Feedback**

Wage trends remained stable from 2015-2020, suggesting equilibrium between labor supply and demand. The narrative supports this analysis, emphasizing the program's alignment with industry wage trends.

**F. Program 13.5 Course Completion**

Program 13.5 Course Completion					
Unduplicated Headcount	2018-29	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	2022-23
Dental Assisting	22	23	0	26	20
Music Technology	64	46	46	46	55
Pharmacy Technology	26	15	12	17	9
Theatre Technology	8	7	1	4	6

CTE courses offered between 2018-19 and 2022-23 that were used to retrieve completion counts include the following:  
 Dental Assisting: DA 50, 51A, 51B, 51C, 53A, 53B, 53C, 56, 57, 58, 60A, 60B, 62A, 62B, 62C, 63, 65, 66, 67, 71, 73, 74, 85, 88, 100, 200L  
 Music Technology: MTECH 49, 50A, 51A, 51B, 51C, 52A, 52B, 53A, 53B, 54A, 55A, 55B, 55C, 57A, 57B, 60A, 60B, 62A, 62B, 62C, 70A, 70B, 70C, 70D, 70E, 70F, 72B, 72C, 80A, 82A, 88A, 88B, 88C, 90A  
 Pharmacy Technology: PHT 50, 51, 52A, 52B, 53, 54A, 54B, 55A, 55B, 55C, 56, 56A, 56B, 58, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64A, 64B, 101, 102, 103, 200L  
 Theatre Technology: THTR 21A, 21B, 21C, 25, 25B, 27, 31, 40A, 40B, 42, 45A, 45B, 45C, 45D, 45E, 45F

1. In the data table above, what does the data trend indicate about the number of students completing the 13.5 CTE units each year in the last five years within your program?

- The number of students completing 13.5 units increased over the 5 year period or stayed flat over the 5 year period - Meets Expectations
- The number of students completing 13.5 units decreased over the 5 year period - Needs Improvement

2. If the data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in the number of students completing the 13.5 CTE units, explain why.

**Narrative Criteria**

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

**Feedback**

Data indicates a recovery in course completion rates following a decline during the pandemic. The program's efforts to adapt and return to on-campus classes have positively impacted these rates.

**G. Program Graduate Employment Rates**

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/24-25-pr-data/cte-data/cte-graduate-employment-2024-25.pdf>

1. In the data table above, what does the graduate employment rate indicate for certificate/degree completers (e.g., Within one year after Community College Completion)?

- Employment rate is between 100% and 80% - Meets Expectations
- Employment rate is less than 80% - Needs Improvement

2. Describe the graduate employment rate trend for both certificates and degrees. If the projected data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease, explain why.

**Narrative Criteria**

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

### Feedback

Graduate employment rates held steady at 64% until 2020, then declined to 48% due to the pandemic's impact. The program recognizes this challenge but could explore targeted initiatives to improve employment outcomes, such as partnerships with local employers or enhanced career services.

## H. Summative Evaluation

Overall, the Career & Technical Education Addendum

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

### Feedback

Overall, the program demonstrates strong alignment with industry needs, effective use of advisory board feedback, and resilience during the pandemic. Areas for improvement include addressing labor supply challenges and graduate employment rates to ensure continued success.

### End of CTE Rubric 2024

---

This form is completed and ready for acceptance.