

# Rubric Comprehensive Program Review & CTE 2024

Rubric CPR Template 2024

## Rubric Comprehensive Program Review 2024

Instructional Discipline Template

### A. Program Information

#### Narrative Criteria

The Program Mission Statement

- clearly states the purpose of the program
- indicates the primary function
- indicates the activities of the program
- describes the programs' aspirational goals for the future and what the program hopes to achieve
- reflects the program's priorities and values
- indicates who the students and/or stakeholders are
- is aligned to the college mission statement
- is clear and concise

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

#### Feedback

This is a solid program description, however, a new college mission statement was approved by the college and the BOT in Fall 2023. Please review the program mission statement to confirm align with the college mission statement: <https://foothill.edu/2030-foothill/mission-review-committee.html> Consider whether a stronger reference to the workforce/workforce prep is relevant in the program mission statement.

### B. Enrollment Trends

#### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

#### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

- Data
- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

- Narrative
- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

#### Feedback

Good observations with enrollment and identifying the goal of maintain steady enrollment to meet demand and workforce needs. The reader team encourages the program to monitor ongoing enrollment given that the apprenticeship program has sunset. Will enrollment continue to stabilize and even increase with the absence of the apprenticeship program? As the program has identified collaboration with dental hygiene, assessment of enrollment impact (e.g. FTES, sections, PROD) should be monitored moving forward so that the efforts between the two programs is not the dependent driver for enrollment for dental assisting. The observation that a permanent program director is crucial is noted in terms of providing program leadership, consistency, and to better support planning efforts.

### C. Enrollment by Student Demographics

### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Data

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

### Feedback

The program has increased diversity in enrollment by student ethnicity over the 5 years. The reader team encourages the program to continue monitoring the representation in enrollment so that the program continues to effectively serve our student body. For example, there is a decline in Latinx enrollment in the past year and the program should monitor if that becomes a trend.

## D. Overall Student Course Success

Click the link below to view the program's Course Success by Modality data

[https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f/g/personal/20078222\\_fhda\\_edu/Euw5yUwbvn5OiqkDTAn6yIYBycY0PminLpXnQm47I7cPKQ?e=rSml5L](https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f/g/personal/20078222_fhda_edu/Euw5yUwbvn5OiqkDTAn6yIYBycY0PminLpXnQm47I7cPKQ?e=rSml5L)

### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Data

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

### Feedback

The success rates by modality are fairly comparable especially over the past two years. The program is to be commended for setting a course success goal rate higher than the college course success rate. The shift back to offering more face-to-face sections demonstrates that a high course success rate can be maintained (see increase in success rates over the past three years as the number of sections offered face-to-face went from 12 in 2021-22 to 21 in 2023-24).

As the apprenticeship program has sunset, we encourage the program to monitor the success rates for all students to ensure that the cohorts in the 9-mon program continue to experience success at high rates.

## E. Disproportionate Impact

Click the link below to view the program's Disproportionate Impact data

### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Data

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

### Feedback

Good goals with respect to disproportionate students. However, the reader team recommends prioritizing the identified strategies about how disproportionate impact will be addressed. Enhancing student communication and regular check-ins could be implemented immediately.

## F. Regular and Substantive Interaction

### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

### Feedback

Would be helpful to see the internal communication plan.

## G. Summative Evaluation

Overall, the Comprehensive Program Review

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

### Feedback

The reader team supports providing the program with additional resources, however we recommend faculty prioritize ways they can directly support the students should the prioritization and availability of resources be limited moving forward. Appreciate the reflections shared about the changes in the enrollment sources over the past five years (e.g. 9-month program, apprenticeship track, COVID), and encourage the program to continue to identify areas (and implement supports such as the check-ins the program identified) that ensure stability/increase in student enrollment and success.

End of Rubric CPR Template 2024

CTE Rubric 2024

Career and Technical Education Programs Rubric 2024

## A. Re-Accreditation Information

### 2. Did the program maintain accreditation?

- The program was reaccredited and received commendations or citations or recommendations - Meets Expectations
- The program was put on probation - Needs Improvement

### 5. What actions has the program taken to address the accreditation citations/recommendations? What barriers has the program faced in implementing improvements?

Did the program make the required improvements?

- The program was able to take actions and received the needed support to take the actions - Meets Expectations
- The program was not able to take actions to improve because it did not get the support needed from the college - Needs Some Improvement
- The program had the needed support to take actions but did not act or is limited in direction from the accreditor to take actions - Needs Major Improvement
- Not Applicable (The program did not receive recommendations)

#### Feedback

N/A

## B. Advisory Board

1. Did the program hold an annual advisory board meeting each year of the five-year cycle?
2. Did the program submit the advisory board meeting minutes each year of the five-year cycle?
3. Did the program include the web address/link to the online minutes?

- Yes the program held an annual meeting of the advisory board and submitted the minutes - Meets Expectations
- No, the program did not hold an annual meeting of the advisory board and/or did not submit the minutes - Needs Improvement

### 4. Were there any advisory board commendations/special mentions identified?

- The program received commendations - Meets Expectations
- Not Applicable

### 5. Are there any identified actions for improvement or recommendations based on feedback from the program's advisory board?

### 6. What actions has the program taken to address recommendations made by the Advisory Board? What barriers has the program faced in implementing improvements?

- The program was able to take actions or investigate the recommendations and received the needed support to proceed - Meets Expectations
- The program was not able to take actions or investigate because it did not get the support needed - Needs Some Improvement
- The program had the needed support to take actions but did not act or is limited in direction from the advisory board to take actions - Needs Major Improvement
- Not Applicable (The program did not receive recommendations)

#### Feedback

Note: Advisory Board minutes were not attached.

The Advisory Board recognizes the workforce shortage and recommended increasing the enrollment. A barrier of implementing increased enrollment is limited by accreditation mandates on faculty to student ratios.

## C. Regional Labor Demand

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/24-25-pr-data/cte-data/cte-labor-demand-2024-25.pdf>

### 1. In the data table above, what does the regional labor demand data trend indicate?

- Labor demand has an upward trend or is projected to be flat - Meets Expectations
- Labor demand is projected to decrease - Needs Improvement

### 2. Describe the regional demand for labor in this sector. If the projected data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in labor demand, explain why.

#### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

## Feedback

## D. Regional Labor Supply

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/24-25-pr-data/cte-data/cte-labor-supply-2024-25.pdf>

1. In the data table above, what does the regional labor supply data trend indicate?

- Labor supply has a downward trend or is projected to be flat - Meets Expectations
- Labor supply is projected to increase - Needs Improvement

2. Describe the regional supply for labor in this sector over the last five years. If the data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in labor supply, explain why.

### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

## Feedback

N/A

## E. Regional Wages

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/24-25-pr-data/cte-data/cte-regional-wages-2024-25.pdf>

1. In the data table above, what does the wage data trend indicate?

- The occupational wage trend increased or stayed flat - Meets Expectations
- The occupational wage trend decreased - Needs Improvement

2. Describe the regional trend for wages in this sector over the last five years. If the data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in wages, explain why.

### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

## Feedback

The regional trend for wages is not within the control of the program.

## F. Program 13.5 Course Completion

Program 13.5 Course Completion					
Unduplicated Headcount	2018-19	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	2022-23
Dental Assisting	22	23	0	26	20
Music Technology	64	46	46	46	55
Pharmacy Technology	26	15	12	17	9
Theatre Technology	8	7	1	4	6

CTE courses offered between 2018-19 and 2022-23 that were used to retrieve completion counts include the following:

Dental Assisting: DA 50, 51A, 51B, 51C, 53A, 53B, 53C, 56, 57, 58, 60A, 60B, 62A, 62B, 62C, 63, 65, 66, 67, 71, 73, 74, 85, 88, 100, 200L

Music Technology: MTECH 49, 50A, 51A, 51B, 51C, 52A, 52B, 53A, 53B, 54A, 55A, 55B, 55C, 57A, 57B, 60A, 60B, 62A, 62B, 62C, 70A, 70B, 70C, 70D, 70E, 70F, 72B, 72C, 80A, 82A, 88A, 88B, 88C, 90A

Pharmacy Technology: PHT 50, 51, 52A, 52B, 53, 54A, 54B, 55A, 55B, 55C, 56, 56A, 56B, 58, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64A, 64B, 101, 102, 103, 200L

Theatre Technology: THTR 21A, 21B, 21C, 25, 25B, 27, 31, 40A, 40B, 42, 45A, 45B, 45C, 45D, 45E, 45F

1. In the data table above, what does the data trend indicate about the number of students completing the 13.5 CTE units each year in the last five years within your program?

- The number of students completing 13.5 units increased over the 5 year period or stayed flat over the 5 year period - Meets Expectations
- The number of students completing 13.5 units decreased over the 5 year period - Needs Improvement

2. If the data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in the number of students completing the 13.5 CTE units, explain why.

#### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

#### Feedback

Has the program changes and the external changes stabilized? What are some ways the program can support students? Were there barriers that contributed to student success? The reader team encourages the program to continue monitoring student retention to ensure students completion.

### G. Program Graduate Employment Rates

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/24-25-pr-data/cte-data/cte-graduate-employment-2024-25.pdf>

1. In the data table above, what does the graduate employment rate indicate for certificate/degree completers (e.g., Within one year after Community College Completion)?

- Employment rate is between 100% and 80% - Meets Expectations
- Employment rate is less than 80% - Needs Improvement

2. Describe the graduate employment rate trend for both certificates and degrees. If the projected data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease, explain why.

#### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

#### Feedback

What are some of the reasons graduates are not employed? Have surveys been sent to the graduates to gather data on employment? By identifying the reason for graduate employment, the program can address the issues that could be correlated to the decrease in wages.

### H. Summative Evaluation

Overall, the Career & Technical Education Addendum

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

#### Feedback

Link to Advisory Committee Meeting minutes is missing.

End of CTE Rubric 2024

This form is completed and ready for acceptance.