

WESTERN ASSOCIATION OF SCHOOLS AND COLLEGES

May 1, 2017

Dr. Thuy Nguyen President Foothill College 12345 El Monte Road Los Altos Hills, CA 94022

Dear President Nguyen:

The Committee on Substantive Change of the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges, Western Association of Schools and Colleges met April 21, 2017 to review the Six Month Baccalaureate Program Follow-Up Visiting Team Report for Foothill College. The Final Report from the team is attached.

The Baccalaureate Program Team Report for the College will be forwarded to the Comprehensive Evaluation Team scheduled in the Fall of 2017. This team will review the progress of the baccalaureate program to address the recommendations from the Baccalaureate Substantive Change Visiting Team.

On behalf of the Commission, I wish to express appreciation for the work that the College undertook to develop and implement this baccalaureate degree. If you should have any questions concerning this letter or the Committee action, please don't hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely, Norval L. Wellsfry,

Vice President

cc: Dr. Andrew LaManque, Accreditation Liaison Officer

# The Report of Substantive Change 6-Month Site Visit for Baccalaureate Degrees

Visitation Date: February 2, 2017

# **COLLEGE:** Foothill College

# **PROGRAM:** Bachelor in Science Dental Hygiene Degree

Team Chair: Program Content Representative: Baccalaureate Content Representative: ACCJC Representative:

Deborah Ikeda Dr. Teri Trede Dr. Teri Trede Dr. Norv Wellsfry

Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges, Western Association of Schools and Colleges

#### Introduction and Summary of visit

A three-member accreditation team visited Foothill College on February 2, 2017, for the purposes of evaluating how well the College's Dental Hygiene Baccalaureate Program meets the Accreditation Standards, Eligibility Requirements, Commission Policies and USDE Regulations. In preparation for the visit, the three-member team studied the Commission prepared template for reviewing the Baccalaureate Degree Programs, read the College's Special Report for the Baccalaureate Degree and assessed the various forms of evidence provided by the institution.

Prior to the visit team members requested the College provide additional material on the day of the on-site evaluation. The team met the evening before to discuss their views of the written material and evidence provided by the institution.

During the visit, the team interviewed over 35 faculty, staff, students and administrators. The team visited the Dental Hygiene Baccalaureate class and had an opportunity to interview the students. The team also visited the Dental Hygiene Clinic and labs associated with the program.

The team reviewed the material in the team room that had been requested and had access to all electronic evidence. The team room included all the necessary resources required for the visit.

The College was well prepared for the visit and everyone on campus was welcoming and helpful. The team felt that the Special Report was comprehensive and thorough. The College community made themselves available for interviews and last minute appointments and was very accommodating.

#### Team observations

The team reviewed the Special Report on the Baccalaureate Degree for Dental Hygiene using the Template for Substantive Change 6-Month Site Visit for the Baccalaureate Degree prepared by ACCJC. As a result of this review, the team found the College to be in substantial compliance with all applicable Eligibility Requirements, accreditation standards, Commission Policies and USDE regulations with a few exceptions. Having just started the new program in fall 2016, there was limited data for conducting program or course level student learning outcomes assessment. The team was unable to assess those standards that require assessment of such data and is recommending a follow-up report to be submitted to the Commission in fall 2018, subsequent to the completion of the first cohort.

The team also is recommending that the College review their Mission statement in light of the addition of a Baccalaureate Degree Program as the current Mission statement does not identify the new Baccalaureate mission. The upper division general education is short 1 quarter unit and that needs to be addressed.

The following review of standards were applied by the visiting team to the baccalaureate program previously approved through the substantive change process.

<u>Areas of Inquiry</u> Mission and Authorization:

Eligibility Requirement 1 Accreditation Standards: I.A.1, I.A.2, I.A.3, I.c.1, II.A.1 Student Learning Outcomes: I.B.2, I.C.3, I.C.4, II.A.3, II.A.11 Institution Set Standards: I.B3 Assessment: I.B.7 Baccalaureate Requirements: II.A.5, II.A.6, II.A.9, II.,10, II.A.13, II.A.14 General Education: II.A.12 Support Services/Library: II.B.1, II.C.6 Infrastructure Support: III.A.1, III.B.3, III.C.1, III.D.1, IV.A.4 Faculty Qualifications: III.A.2, III.A.7

The Comprehensive review of the College will occur in Fall 2017.

# Eligibility Requirements and Accreditation Standards

The Eligibility Requirement and Accreditation Standards listed below apply to the institution as a whole and to each baccalaureate program. As appropriate, the list includes criteria indicating how the Standards specifically apply to baccalaureate programs. In addressing the Standards, the institution must also address and provide evidence of its practices for the baccalaureate program-specific evaluation criteria identified below.

## Area of Inquiry - Mission/Authorization

Foothill College is authorized to award a Bachelor of Science (B.S.) degree in Dental Hygiene and needs to review the Mission to include this new B.S. degree.

**Eligibility Requirement 1. Authority:** The institution is authorized or licensed to operate as a post-secondary educational institution and to award degrees by an appropriate governmental organization or agency as required by each of the jurisdictions or regions in which it operates. Private institutions, if required by the appropriate statutory regulatory body, must submit evidence of authorization, licensure, or approval by that body. If incorporated, the institution shall submit a copy of its articles of incorporation.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• Authority requires that an institution be authorized or licensed as a post-secondary institution to award degrees. An institution wishing to gain approval for a baccalaureate degree will have to provide evidence of the institution's authorization to offer the degree, as required by each of the jurisdictions or regions in which it operates.

## Evidence:

The team reviewed the press release from the California Community College Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) issued on March 16, 2015 indicating that Foothill College had been selected for approval to offer a Baccalaureate Degree in Dental Hygiene. In addition, the team reviewed the letter from the CCCCO authorizing Foothill College to offer the B.S. degree in Dental Hygiene.

## Findings:

The visiting team confirmed that Foothill College is authorized to operate as an educational institution and is authorized by the State of California to award certificates and degrees

## Standard I.A. Mission:

**Standard I.A.1**, *The mission describes the institution's broad educational purposes, its intended student population, the types of degrees and other credentials it offers, and its commitment to student learning and student achievement. (ER 6)* 

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- Baccalaureate degrees generally extend beyond previously identified credentials, service areas, and intended student populations. Member institutions may need to make changes within the institutional mission to reflect these differences.
- The baccalaureate degree program must align with the Institutional mission.
- Student demand for the baccalaureate degree should demonstrate its correlation with the institutional mission.

#### Evidence:

The team reviewed the minutes of the Planning and Resource Council (PaRC) from Nov. 2015 and Board Minutes from Feb. 2016. In addition, the Dental Hygiene Program Website was viewed.

#### Findings:

The team reviewed the College Mission Statement that was approved by the Board of Trustees in Feb. 2016 after going through a vetting process at the college. The team found that the Baccalaureate Degree Dental Hygiene Program does not align with the current College mission. There is no mention of the Mission including a B.S. level degree.

The College provided data to document that the Employment Development Department (EDD) that Dental Hygiene was one of the fastest growing occupations for the San Jose- Santa Clara-Sunnyvale area at 29% higher that the projected statewide growth.

The team recommends that the college review the Mission statement and ensure it includes offering a B.S. degree as part of the Mission.

**Standard I.A.2:** The institution uses data to determine how effectively it is accomplishing its mission, and whether the mission directs institutional priorities in meeting the educational needs of students.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• The assessment of data, in addition to measuring institution effectiveness, must also demonstrate the effectiveness and success of the baccalaureate program.

#### Evidence:

The team reviewed the Planning and Resource Council (PaRC) Minutes of Oct. 15, 2014 where the Program Review Annual and Comprehensive Templates were approved. The team reviewed the PaRC website which included the 2016-27 Strategic College Objectives and the Institutional

Effectiveness Indicators. The Dental Hygiene Program Review documents were posted on the Program website and were reviewed by team.

#### Findings:

The Team found that the College has a robust integrated planning process that utilizes the Mission Statement to direct College Strategic planning. The current Dental Hygiene Program has a 100% pass rate on the Dental Hygiene National Board Exam and has been ranked among the top Dental Hygiene Programs in the nation. It's clear that the Dental Hygiene Program uses the Program Review Process to assess student success in the Dental Hygiene Program and makes adjustments to the program deemed necessary. For example, the program had a recommendation to increase diversity in the program so a number of outreach activities were conducted which resulted in a significantly more diverse class than the averages nationwide in Dental Hygiene Programs. The College utilizes Tracdat to track learning outcomes assessment and is in progress to track the Dental Hygiene learning outcomes assessment.

**Standard I.A.3:** The institution's programs and services are aligned with its mission. The mission guides institutional decision-making, planning, and resource allocation and informs institutional goals for student learning and achievement.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- The baccalaureate program is clearly aligned with the institutional mission.
- The institution has included the baccalaureate degree in its decision making and planning processes, and in setting its goals for student learning and achievement.

#### Evidence:

The Team reviewed the College Website for the Mission, the PaRC website, the PaRC Orientation, the minutes from the Dental Hygiene Advisory Committee and the Biological and Health Science Division Meeting and the Foothill Instructional Program Review Website that included all the Student Learning Outcomes for Programs.

## Findings:

The College revised the Mission statement in Nov. 2015 and the Board approved it in Feb. 2016. The Dental Hygiene Program B.S. degree is not clearly aligned with the Institutional Mission. The PaRC is a college-wide participatory governance body responsible for making recommendations to the President regarding planning and assessment of all college-wide plans, including the Strategic Plan Commitments, all Program Reviews recommendations as they relate to budget implications, Facilities Plans, Technology Plans, Student Equity Plans and DSPS Plans. The PaRC is responsible for prioritizing expenditures to advance strategic initiatives including requests for all resources. The PaRC included resource needs for the new Baccalaureate Program in Dental Hygiene in its planning processes. Although the Mission statement does not include the new B.S. degree, the planning processes did recognize the need for resources for the new B.S. degree and provided for adequate resources.

**Standard I.C.1:** *The institution assures the clarity, accuracy, and integrity of information provided to students and prospective students, personnel, and all persons or organizations related* 

to its mission statement, learning outcomes, educational programs, and student support services. The institution gives accurate information to students and the public about its accreditation status with all of its accreditors. (ER 20)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• Information related to baccalaureate programs are clear and accurate in all aspects of this Standard, especially in regard to learning outcomes, program requirements, and student support services.

#### Evidence:

The team reviewed the Dental Hygiene website, the online catalog and program brochure. The team interviewed students enrolled in the program.

#### Findings:

The information in the catalog, program brochure and on the College Dental Hygiene Program website was clear and accurate and included program requirements as well as a listing of student support services. In addition, the online listing of Dental Hygiene courses included the Student Learning Outcomes for each course. The students interviewed found the information for the program clear and easy to follow. Applying to the program was a very simple process for the students.

**Standard II.A.1:** All instructional programs, regardless of location or means of delivery, including distance education and correspondence education, are offered in fields of study consistent with the institution's mission, are appropriate to higher education, and culminate in student attainment of identified student learning outcomes, and achievement of degrees, certificates, employment, or transfer to other higher education programs. (ER 9 and ER 11)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- The baccalaureate degree field of study aligns with the institutional mission.
- Student demand for the baccalaureate degree program demonstrates its correlation with the institutional mission.

#### Evidence:

The Team reviewed the Mission Statement on the College Website as well as the Mission Statement for the Dental Hygiene Program. The Team also reviewed the EDD "2010-2020 Fastest Growing Occupations for San Jose-Santa Clara-Sunnyvale" and the October 2015 Dental Hygiene Alumni poll – to see that 65% of the DH students were interested in pursuing a BS degree in DH. The team also reviewed the program and student learning outcomes for the Dental Hygiene degree.

## Findings:

The team reviewed the college Mission Statement and found that the Baccalaureate Degree in Dental Hygiene was missing from the Mission statement as mentioned earlier. The team also viewed the Board of Trustee minutes from March 3, 2014 where the Board expressed support for

the Baccalaureate Degree for Dental Hygiene. The team also viewed the minutes from the Chancellor's Advisory Council where the Dental Hygiene Program from Foothill College was selected as the one college in the District to offer a Baccalaureate Degree. Student demand for a baccalaureate degree in Dental Hygiene was evidenced in the poll administered to Dental Hygiene Alumni where 65% of the graduates were interested in pursuing a Baccalaureate degree in Dental Hygiene. The EDD report clearly shows that Dental Hygiene is one of the fastest growing occupations in the area.

#### Area of Inquiry - Student Learning outcomes

Foothill College started the first Dental Hygiene class in fall 2016 and the courses and program have the required learning outcomes identified and approved by the Curriculum Committee. However, there is limited data available for assessment of the learning outcomes particularly at the Program level until the first cohort of students graduate. There are robust processes in place for outcomes assessment and the College is prepared to conduct the assessments as soon as data becomes available.

# **Standard I.B.2** *The institution defines and assesses student learning outcomes for all instructional programs and student and learning support services.* (ER 11)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- Student learning outcomes for upper division baccalaureate courses reflect higher levels of depth and rigor generally expected in higher education.
- Assessment must be accurate and distinguish the baccalaureate degree outcomes from those of other programs.

Evidence: Course descriptions, College Catalog and Program webpages, Program Course Catalog (Online); Special Report Narrative.

#### Findings:

The institution has a systematic process for college-wide program review and a continuous assessment cycle. The program has not yet completed an assessment cycle for program assessment given it is new and in the pilot process, however, it will be subjected to the same institutional assessment processes. SLOs reflect higher order learning outcomes. Example SLO phrases from course outlines include, "integrate", "assess", "perform", "critically evaluate", and "demonstrate". Methods of assessment listed on course outlines include exams, written projects, laboratory skills performance, clinical observation, and community service field work skills observation and submission of an ePortfolio.

**Standard I.C.3:** The institution uses documented assessment of student learning and evaluation of student achievement to communicate matters of academic quality to appropriate constituencies, including current and prospective students and the public. (ER 19)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• The assessment results of student learning and student achievement in the baccalaureate programs are used in the communication of academic quality.

#### Evidence:

Office of Research and Planning Website; Program Review Handbook; program review data website; Special Report narrative; Curriculum Committee webpage; Course Catalog

#### Findings:

The baccalaureate program is expected to launch as a pilot in 2017, thus there is currently no assessment of learning and student achievement available. However, review of evidence shows a documented process of ongoing, college-wide program assessment. Program review data is reviewed by a committee and integrated with budget and resource allocation. The Curriculum Review Committee reviews all curriculum and forwards recommendation to the governing body. The Special Report narrative indicates students receive a "green sheet" for all courses that includes the student learning outcomes, learning objectives and goals, grading criteria, assignments, projects and evaluation methodology for the course, information that is also available on the Course Catalog webpage. SLOs are reviewed each quarter by instructors and annually by administrators and college governing committees.

**Standard I.C.4:** The institution describes its certificates and degrees in terms of their purpose, content, course requirements, and expected learning outcomes.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• The purpose, content, course requirements and learning outcomes of the baccalaureate programs are clearly described.

*Evidence:* The catalog, published in printed form and is also available in electronic format on the college's website; the class schedules, the student handbook, and the faculty/staff handbook; Dental Hygiene Program webpages; Special Report narrative

*Findings:* The Foothill College catalog and Dental Hygiene Program webpages include comprehensive information regarding program purpose, content, course requirements program and course learning outcomes for the baccalaureate program. Program goals and professional competencies are found on the Program Webpages. Course outlines contain specific information on student learning outcomes, course requirements and objectives.

**Standard II.A.3:** The institution identifies and regularly assesses learning outcomes for courses, programs, certificates and degrees using established institutional procedures. The institution has officially approved and current course outlines that include student learning

outcomes. In every class section students receive a course syllabus that includes learning outcomes from the institution's officially approved course outline.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• Learning outcomes for baccalaureate courses, programs, and degrees are identified and assessed consistent with institutional processes.

## Evidence:

2014-15 Dental Hygiene Comprehensive Program Review; Dental Hygiene Comprehensive Program Review Data Sheet; Dental Hygiene Comprehensive Program Review Workforce Data; Special Report narrative; site visit discussions with college and program representatives

## Findings:

New degrees, certificates and general education requirements are reviewed by the Curriculum Review committee, which reviews for technical standards, appropriate rigor, and adherence to general education requirements as per state mandates. SLOs are included Course Outlines of Record and syllabi. Institutional procedures provide on-going comprehensive assessment at all levels and include, annual reviews and a six-year planning process for SLO/PLO review, program review and planning and resource prioritization. The Dental Hygiene program outcomes reflect a somewhat global focus targeting more reflective practice and application of knowledge in line with upper division educational expectations preparing graduates for a variety of career options in the dental field.

The baccalaureate program has published learning outcomes and has institutional processes in place for ongoing assessment of student learning. The team encourages the program to modify PLO1 in order to increase specificity and allow for more accurate program outcome assessment.

**Standard II.A.11:** The institution includes in all of its programs, student learning outcomes, appropriate to the program level, in communication competency, information competency, quantitative competency, analytic inquiry skills, ethical reasoning, the ability to engage diverse perspectives, and other program-specific learning outcomes.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• Student learning outcomes in baccalaureate programs are consistent with generally accepted norms in higher education and reflect the higher levels expected at the baccalaureate level.

## Evidence:

Foothill College Institutional Learning Outcomes webpages; 2014-15 Dental Hygiene Comprehensive Program Review; Dental Hygiene Comprehensive Program Review Data Sheet; College Catalog

## Findings:

Institutional Learning Outcomes are clearly stated in multiple places, such as the Institutional Outcomes webpages, the College website and College catalog. The college has defined 4 core

competencies, Communication, Computation, Creative, Critical and Analytical Thinking and Community/Global Consciousness and Responsibility, as critical to student learning beyond their chosen discipline. BSDH Program and Course level learning outcomes are consistent with expected norms of higher education and upper division learning. SLOs integrate concepts of professionalism, analysis, ethical reasoning, demonstration and application of learning, clinical competencies, and build upon knowledge attained at the lower division.

## Area of Inquiry – Institution Set Standards

The College has established Institution Set Standards for the baccalaureate degree program and has robust mechanisms in place to assess these on a regular basis. Assessment of these standards has not yet occurred as there is no data yet available due to the program starting in fall 2016.

**Standard I.B.3**: The institution establishes institution-set standards for student achievement, appropriate to its mission, assesses how well it is achieving them in pursuit of continuous improvement, and publishes this information. (*ER 11*)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- The Institution has institution-set standards for the baccalaureate program and assesses performance related to those standards. It uses this assessment to improve the quality of the baccalaureate program.
- Student Achievement standards are separately identified and assessed for baccalaureate programs to distinguish them from associate degree programs.

## Evidence:

The team reviewed the Institutional Standards submitted to ACCJC, the Dental Hygiene Program Website, the college website for Institutional Effectiveness and the narrative presented in the Special Report for the Baccalaureate Degree for Dental Hygiene.

#### Findings:

Foothill College established Institutional Effectiveness Indicators for student achievement that aligned with the College Mission and these indicators are assessed annually. The Dental Hygiene Program writes a program review document annually evaluating the program student learning outcomes which include assessment of student achievement results. The Dental Hygiene faculty participate in annual calibration meetings to discuss results of the program review and made adjustments to the program. The primary data used to assess student success are results from the National Dental Hygiene Board Exams and the RDH Clinical Licensing Exams, California Law and Ethics Exams and the comprehensive e-portfolio project. These reviews result in revised SLO's for the program. The Dental Hygiene faculty developed new

SLO's for the Baccalaureate level classes and these will be assessed in a similar fashion. The new SLO's reflect higher levels of depth and rigor that are expected at the baccalaureate level.

# Area of Inquiry - Assessment

The College has systematic processes place to conduct assessment at the course, program and institution level. Although there is currently no assessment data for the new program to review at this point, there is an expectation that the college will align the new Dental Hygiene B.S. Degree Program with the regular assessment processes in place at the college.

**Standard I.B.7**: The institution regularly evaluates its policies and practices across all areas of the institution, including instructional programs, student and learning support services, resource management, and governance processes to assure their effectiveness in supporting academic quality and accomplishment of mission.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• The institutional evaluation policies and practices recognize the unique aspects and requirements of the baccalaureate program in relation to learning and student support services and resource allocation and management.

## Evidence:

Special Report Narrative; Annual Program Review webpages

## Findings:

Institutional planning and program evaluation is a systematic process including all departments and divisions college-wide. This systematic cycle integrates evaluation, planning, resource allocation, implementation and reevaluation. Although there is no assessment history as of yet for the BSDH, evidence indicates that the program will be fully aligned with the current process. Additionally, Dental Hygiene programs also maintain CODA accreditation through ongoing program outcome assessments, curriculum review, planning and implementation. The Curriculum committee oversaw changing course content, SLOs and numbering to align with upper division norms, and approved all upper division BSDH curriculum and will continue to be instrumental in design and evaluation of curriculum going forward. Area of Inquiry – Baccalaureate Requirements – Units/upper Division ACCJC requires 9 SEMESTER units of upper division General Education and Foothill College offers 13 QUARTER units of upper division General Education in the Dental Hygiene B.S. Program. This is one QUARTER unit short of 9 semester units and will have to be corrected.

**Standard II.A.5:** The institution's degrees and programs follow practices common to American higher education, including appropriate length, breadth, depth, rigor, course sequencing, time to completion, and synthesis of learning. The institution ensures that minimum degree requirements are 60 semester credits or equivalent at the associate level, and 120 credits or equivalent at the baccalaureate level. (ER 12)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- A Minimum of 40 semester credits or equivalent of total upper division coursework including the major and general education is required.
- The academic credit awarded for upper division courses within baccalaureate programs is clearly distinguished from that of lower division courses.
- The instructional level and curriculum of the upper division courses in the baccalaureate degree are comparable to those commonly accepted among like degrees in higher education and reflect the higher levels of knowledge and intellectual inquiry expected at the baccalaureate level.
- Student expectations, including learning outcomes, assignments and examinations of the upper division courses demonstrate the rigor commonly accepted among like degrees in higher education.
- The program length and delivery mode of instruction are appropriate for the expected level of rigor.

## Evidence:

BSDH Program webpages; the College Catalog (specifically the BSDH pages); the Dental Hygiene Curriculum webpage; Special Report narrative

## Findings:

The BSDH degree meets institutional policy on degrees and credits with the exception of the 9 semester units of upper division general education. The 129 semester credit units is comparable to other accredited dental hygiene programs. It exceeds the minimum number of units required. However the program offers 13 quarter units of upper-division general education and that is equivalent to 8.66 semester units (13 quarter units x .666 semester units = 8.658 semester units). Therefore the College needs to add one quarter unit to the upper-division general education

pattern. The program added upper-division coursework in critical thinking, writing and research at the upper-division level for the baccalaureate degree, appropriate to expected learning outcomes in higher education.

The 2 years of BSDH coursework would be 100 units of dental hygiene core courses, Inter-professional allied health courses, and upper division general education with the rigor and depth expected at the baccalaureate level.

**Standard II.A.6:** The institution schedules courses in a manner that allows students to complete certificate and degree programs within a period of time consistent with established expectations in higher education.<sup>1</sup> (*ER* 9)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• Baccalaureate courses are scheduled to ensure that students will complete those programs in a reasonable period of time.

#### Evidence:

Special Report Narrative; Dental Hygiene Curriculum page; Dental Hygiene Curriculum Sheet

#### Findings:

The proposed Upper division BSDH courses are scheduled for a cohort of 24 students. Proposed course schedules are posted a number of places and map out year-by-year course plans for each of 4 years (accounting for lower division). Junior and Senior years also account for General Education courses if needed. The published course schedules contain 194 quarter units (129 semester units).

**Standard II.A.9:** The institution awards course credit, degrees and certificates based on student attainment of learning outcomes. Units of credit awarded are consistent with institutional policies that reflect generally accepted norms or equivalencies in higher education. If the institution offers courses based on clock hours, it follows Federal standards for clock-to-credit-hour conversions. (ER 10)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• Baccalaureate Degrees and the course credit in those programs are based on student learning outcomes. These outcomes are consistent with generally accepted norms and equivalencies in higher education, especially in relation to upper division courses.

## Evidence:

BSDH Course Catalog; College catalog; American Dental Health Association webpage; Course Outlines; BSDH Program pages; Special Report narrative

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Glossary- Established expectations in higher education (also, appropriate for, accepted in, common to, accepted norms in, etc): Shared and time honored principles, values and practices within the American community of higher education.

#### Findings:

The BSDH degree curriculum is based on Commission of Dental Accreditation (CODA) curricular mandates, California Dental Hygiene Committee regulations for dental hygiene education programs and professional practice standards as put forth by the American Dental Hygienists Association. Program and Student Learning Outcomes are in line with the rigor and depth of study expected in higher education, upper division courses. SLOs reflect higher order learning, integrated concepts, and professional competencies related to ethical decision making, demonstration of clinical practice skills, research and application of critical skills for the discipline. All proposed courses contain SLOs and course objectives. Graduates of the program will be eligible to take the National Dental Hygienist (RDH), which is required prior to practicing dental hygiene.

**Standard II.A.10:** The institution makes available to its students clearly stated transfer-of-credit policies in order to facilitate the mobility of students without penalty. In accepting transfer credits to fulfill degree requirements, the institution certifies that the expected learning outcomes for transferred courses are comparable to the learning outcomes of its own courses. Where patterns of student enrollment between institutions are identified, the institution develops articulation agreements as appropriate to its mission. (ER 10)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• Policies for student transfer into the baccalaureate program ensure that all program requirements are fulfilled, including completion of the minimum required semester units, prerequisites, experiential activities, and general education.

#### Evidence:

BSDH Program pages; Dental Hygiene Baccalaureate Degree Brochure; College Catalog

#### Findings:

Pre-requisites for entrance to the upper division program are spelled out on the College website, in the College Catalog and on the BSDH webpages. Contact numbers and email contact information are provided on webpages for students to speak with a counselor about transfers, prerequisites, admission criteria, etc. Moving forward after the pilot, the BSDH pages specify that admission for the BS-DH will require graduation from a CODA accredited dental hygiene program and hold a current RDH license, as well as meet CSU General Education Breadth Requirements or the Intersegmental General Education Transfer Curriculum (IGETC). **Standard II.A.13:** All degree programs include focused study in at least one area of inquiry or in an established interdisciplinary core. The identification of specialized courses in an area of inquiry or interdisciplinary core is based upon student learning outcomes and competencies, and include mastery, at the appropriate degree level, of key theories and practices within the field of study.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• The baccalaureate degree programs include a focused study on one area of inquiry or discipline at the baccalaureate level and include key theories and practices appropriate to the baccalaureate degree level.

## Evidence:

College Catalog; BSDH program pages; CODA Standards; Special Report narrative

## Findings:

The dental hygiene curriculum is a focused study of dental hygiene supported by content, theory, and coursework from related interdisciplinary fields, such as biology and social sciences, research and ethics. The curriculum is aligned with mandates by the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). Course work includes didactic, clinical and laboratory experiences. Each course has SLOs, objectives and expected outcomes appropriate to upper division requirements. The program includes four major competency areas: (1) the dental hygiene process of care, (2) health education, (3) infection and hazard control, (4) legal and ethical practice evaluated across the curriculum through ePortfolio completion.

**Standard II.A.14:** *Graduates completing career-technical certificates and degrees demonstrate technical and professional competencies that meet employment standards and other applicable standards and preparation for external licensure and certification* 

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• The CTE baccalaureate degree ensures students will be able to meet employment standards and licensure or certification as required in the field of study.

## Evidence:

Program Review Data; Dental Program Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

## Findings:

The pilot for the BSDH program is expected to launch in 2017, therefore there is no graduate data reported at this time. However, historical data from the AS dental program, such as pass rates and successful credentialing performance, demonstrates strong evidence of student success and professional competency. The Special Report narrative notes that the pass rate for the 50-year history associate's program has been 100%. This same level of success extends to alumni-reported employment success in the Dental Hygiene field, in that graduates from 2006-2014 reported 100% success in securing a job in the field. Such data speak to the level of competence

and professional preparation graduates of the program attain.

Area of Inquiry – Baccalaureate Requirements – General Education Foothill College has spread the General Education (GE) coursework between lower division and upper division courses. However, the upper division GE is deficient as it does not meet the requirement of 9 equivalent semester units of GE.

**Standard II.A.12:** The institution requires of all of its degree programs a component of general education based on a carefully considered philosophy for both associate and baccalaureate degrees that is clearly stated in its catalog. The institution, relying on faculty expertise, determines the appropriateness of each course for inclusion in the general education curriculum, based upon student learning outcomes and competencies appropriate to the degree level. The learning outcomes include a student's preparation for and acceptance of responsible participation in civil society, skills for lifelong learning and application of learning, and a broad comprehension of the development of knowledge, practice, and interpretive approaches in the arts and humanities, the sciences, mathematics, and social sciences. (ER 12)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- At least 36 semester units or equivalent of lower and upper division general education is required, including at least 9 semester units or equivalent of upper division general education coursework.
- At least 9 semester units or equivalent of upper division general education coursework is required.
- The general education requirements are integrated and distributed to both lower division and upper division courses.
- The general education requirements are distributed across the major subject areas for general education; the distribution appropriately captures the baccalaureate level student learning outcomes and competencies.

## Evidence:

College Catalog; BS Dental Hygiene course pages

## Findings:

Review and calculation of the quarter system credits demonstrate that the program is 1 unit short of meeting the upper division general education requirements. General education requirements are in place for the lower division requirements.

Area of Inquiry – Support Services/Library

Support services including library services are adequate to meet the needs of the Dental Hygiene B.S. degree program. The pathway to enter the program is clearly identified on promotional material, college website and in counseling guides.

**Standard II.B.1:** The institution supports student learning and achievement by providing library and other learning support services to students and to personnel responsible for student learning and support. These services are sufficient in quantity, currency, depth, and variety to support educational programs, regardless of location or means of delivery, including distance education and correspondence education. Learning support services include, but are not limited to, library collections, tutoring, learning centers, computer laboratories, learning technology, and ongoing instruction for users of library and other learning support services.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- Learning support services to support the baccalaureate program are sufficient to support the quality, currency, rigor and depth of the baccalaureate degree and reflect the unique needs of this program.
- Resource collections are sufficient in regard to the rigor, currency, and depth expected of baccalaureate programs.

## Evidence:

Library website; Tutoring website

## Findings:

The institution has extensive services available for student support and faculty, both on campus and online. These include help with research, study support, tutoring, and citation help. The library collections appear sufficient and cross-disciplinary to provide adequate support to all programs at the associate or baccalaureate level. Numerous resources are available specific to the dental field, including eBooks, research journals, and medical-dental databases. Library tools are provided to assist students with efficient and effective use of library services at any time (online). It appears that the library instructs faculty in how to create or revise materials to ensure they are accessible.

**Standard II.C.6:** The institution has adopted and adheres to admission policies consistent with its mission that specify the qualifications of students appropriate for its programs. The institution defines and advises students on clear pathways<sup>2</sup> to complete degrees, certificate and transfer goals. (*ER* 16)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Glossary- Pathways: The specific selection and progression of courses and learning experiences students pursue and complete and they progress in their education toward a certificate, degree, transfer, or other identified educational goal.

- The prerequisites and other qualifications for the baccalaureate are appropriately communicated and applied to students.
- The advising of students related to the baccalaureate degree appropriately identifies course sequencing and pathways.

## Evidence:

College Catalog; College website pages; BSDH Program pages;

## Findings:

Foothill College maintains an open door policy that aligns with the College mission, and the statewide mission for California Community Colleges. The College Catalog and webpages clearly state admission policies, requirements, prerequisites, guidelines, and contact information for student assistance and advisement counseling. Specific prerequisite information for DH programs are outlined on the program website and application, which also notes that the program requires a minimum overall college GPA of 2.5 and science GPA of 2.75. Science courses must have been taken within the last 6 years. A link to a Foothill equivalency chart for prerequisite courses acceptance, and a link to the Application for the BSDH is provided as well. In addition to application instructions, there is extensive information regarding prerequisites, admission criteria, transferability, and a link to estimated program expenses, how to calculate a GPA (grade point average), and curriculum.

## Area of Inquiry – Infrastructure Support

Resources are adequate to meet the needs of the new program. College planning processes were utilized to insure there were adequate resources available for the new baccalaureate program.

## HUMAN RESOURCES

**Standard III.A.1:** The institution assures the integrity and quality of its programs and services by employing administrators, faculty and staff who are qualified by appropriate education, training, and experience to provide and support these programs and services. Criteria, qualifications, and procedures for selection of personnel are clearly and publicly stated and address the needs of the institution in serving its student population. Job descriptions are directly related to institutional mission and goals and accurately reflect position duties, responsibilities, and authority.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• The job descriptions for faculty members teaching in the baccalaureate degree accurately reflect the duties and responsibilities associated with the position.

#### Evidence:

The team reviewed the College Special Report for the Baccalaureate Degree in Dental Hygiene and the faculty contract.

#### Findings:

The listing of faculty academic credentials and experience in the report indicates that current faculty in the program meet the qualifications to teach for the Baccalaureate Degree in Dental Hygiene Program. The duties and responsibilities for faculty members are clearly delineated in the contract and include conducting program review, curriculum development and assessment of student learning outcomes.

The Dentist position was a full-time position and was replaced by three adjunct Dentists who rotate through the clinic. With the addition of a baccalaureate degree program, the team felt a full-time Dentist would provide more consistency in the Dental Hygiene Clinic.

## PHYSICAL RESOURCES

**Standard III.B.3:** To assure the feasibility and effectiveness of physical resources in supporting institutional programs and services, the institution plans and evaluates its facilities and equipment on a regular basis, taking utilization and other relevant data into account.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• The facilities and other physical resources utilized by the baccalaureate program are evaluated for feasibility and effectiveness for the program on a regular basis.

## Evidence:

The team toured the Dental Hygiene Facilities, reviewed the Annual Program Review Report for Dental Hygiene and the Special Report for the Baccalaureate Degree for Dental Hygiene.

## Findings:

The District passed two bond measure which fund a state-of-the-art Dental Hygiene Lab. The Dental Hygiene Program completes an annual Program Review where recommendation are made for facility and equipment needs as necessary. These requests are routed through the College integrated planning and budget allocation process and the department has been given funding regularly to meet program needs. Operational funding has been stable and adequate supplies and timely replacement of equipment has been routine.

## **TECHNOLOGY RESOURCES**

**Standard III.C.1:** Technology services, professional support, facilities, hardware, and software are appropriate and adequate to support the institution's management and operational functions, academic programs, teaching and learning, and support services.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• Technology services, support, facilities, hardware and software utilized by the baccalaureate program are appropriate and adequate for the program.

## Evidence:

The Team reviewed the Special Report for the Baccalaureate Degree for Dental Hygiene, the Draft for 2016-19 Foothill College Technology Master Plan from May 25, 2016.

## Findings:

The Dental Hygiene Program currently has the technology necessary to implement the Baccalaureate Degree Program. The Dental Hygiene Program has been approved to purchase a dental laser and several ultrasonic scaling units during the 2016-17 year. In addition, the clinic has digital radiographic equipment and an electronic patient record system. The College has a draft Technology Plan for 2016-19 where instructional technology needs will be vetted and purchased as recommended by the college integrated and budget allocation process.

## FINANCIAL RESOURCES

**Standard III.D.1:** Financial resources are sufficient to support and sustain student learning programs and services and improve institutional effectiveness. The distribution of resources supports the development, maintenance, allocation and reallocation, and enhancement of programs and services. The institution plans and manages its financial affairs with integrity and in a manner that ensures financial stability. (ER 18)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- The financial resources allocated to the baccalaureate program are sufficient to support and sustain program student learning and effectiveness.
- Financial resources allocated to the baccalaureate program ensure the financial stability of the program.

#### Evidence:

Foothill College Budget, Foothill DeAnza District Budget, interviews with Program faculty and administrators.

#### Findings:

Foothill DeAnza District has a strong budget reserve. The District has an AAA and AA rating with Moody's Investor's Service and Standard & Poor's on most of its general obligation bond issues. The district has passed two bond measures which funded state-of-the-art capital improvements, furniture, fixtures and equipment for the Dental Hygiene Program. Operation funding has been stable and equipment in the Dental Hygiene Clinic has been adequate.

The dentist left the program and was replaced by three adjunct dentists which may create a consistency issue in the Clinic at a time when the new baccalaureate program is being implemented.

The reduction of a full time position reflects adversely on the financial commitment of the College to the baccalaureate program. Although the baccalaureate program in Dental Hygiene meets this accreditation standard, the college should consider a review fiscal resources to fill the full-time Dentist position.

#### **Governance**

**Standard IV.A.4:** Faculty and academic administrators, through policy and procedures, and through well-defined structures, have responsibility for recommendations about curriculum and student learning programs and services.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• The faculty and academic administrators assigned to the baccalaureate program have responsibility for making recommendations to appropriate governance and decision-making bodies about the curriculum, student learning programs, and services for the program.

#### Evidence:

College planning documents, College Curriculum Committee Minutes, Division Curriculum Minutes

#### Findings:

Foothill College has a unique curriculum approval process in place. The Biological and Health Science Division Curriculum Committee first reviews all new programs and courses assigned to their Division. The new Dental Hygiene B.S. degree went through a rigorous Division Curriculum Review process before being approved by the College Curriculum Committee. This process works well for Foothill College and was utilized to quickly get the new curriculum for the Dental Hygiene B.S. degree approved in time to start a fall 2016 class.

## Area of Inquiry – Faculty Qualifications

Faculty qualifications are appropriate in depth and breadth for the Dental Hygiene B.S. Program and all faculty currently teaching in the program meet the requirements. Job descriptions match the qualifications required to teach in the program.

**Standard III.A.2:** Faculty qualifications include knowledge of the subject matter and requisite skills for the service to be performed. Factors of qualification include appropriate degrees, professional experience, discipline expertise, level of assignment, teaching skills, scholarly

activities, and potential to contribute to the mission of the institution. Faculty job descriptions include development and review of curriculum as well as assessment of learning. (ER 14)

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

- The qualifications for faculty teaching upper division courses in the baccalaureate degree include the requirement for a master's degree (or academic credentials at least one level higher than the baccalaureate degree) or doctoral degree, in an appropriate discipline.
- In cases where no Master's degree is available for the field of study, the qualifications for faculty teaching upper division courses in the baccalaureate degree include a bachelor's degree in the discipline or closely related discipline, and a Master's degree in any discipline, and demonstrated industry work experience in the field for a minimum of six years, and commonly required industry-recognized certification or professional licensure.
- The Commission may require some faculty in non-career technical education baccalaureate programs to have the recognized terminal degree in the field of study.

#### Evidence:

Faculty resumes; Special Report narrative

#### Findings:

The BSDH program currently has 2.5 full-time faculty members in the following positions, Program Director, Radiology Instructor/coordinator, and a Second Year Clinic Coordinator. All have a minimum of a Master's Degree, and RDH licensure. Their additional qualifications align with BSDH curricula needs, such as research, curriculum development, educational methodology and program evaluation experience. Additional part-time faculty credentials meet accrediting standards.

**Standard III.A.7:** The institution maintains a sufficient number of qualified faculty, which includes full-time faculty and may include part-time and adjunct faculty, to assure the fulfillment of faculty responsibilities essential to the quality of educational programs and services to achieve institutional mission and purposes.

Specified Baccalaureate Degree Program Evaluation Criteria:

• There is at least one full-time faculty member assigned to the baccalaureate program.

#### Evidence:

Faculty Resumes; program webpages

#### Findings:

The BSDH program has 2.5 fulltime faculty and 10 part-time faculty that meet minimum requirements for teaching Baccalaureate-level Dental Hygiene students. The number of full time

faculty assigned to the program has been reduced since the initiation of the baccalaureate program. A full time supervising dentist position has been replaced with three adjunct positions. This creates a consistency and continuity challenge for the program. Although the program meets the accreditation Standard criteriafor this program, the position should be replaced.

## **Catalog Requirements**

The institution assures that the Catalog provides the following information about the baccalaureate degree program:

- 1. General Information
  - Course Program and Degree Offerings
  - Student Learning Outcomes for Programs and Degrees
- 2. Requirements for
  - Degrees, Certificates, Graduation and Transfer

#### Evidence:

Online catalog and website

#### Findings:

The team found the required information and program requirements for the Dental Hygiene B.S. degree.

#### Conclusions:

The baccalaureate program in Dental Hygiene meets this accreditation requirement.

## RECOMMENDATIONS AND FOLLOWUP

The College is scheduled for a comprehensive site visit in 2018. This report will be forwarded to the site visiting team. The College should consider the comments included in this report as it prepares for the comprehensive site visit.

The team has identified areas where the criteria for the baccalaureate degree were not met

\_

The College Mission Statement does not include a reference to the baccalaureate degree. (Standards I.A.1, I.A.3, and II.A.1)

The number of units of upper division General Education must be increased in order to meet the required criteria. (Standard II.A.5 and II.A.12)